SANMITRA MANDAL

P. B. Homoeopathic Medical College & Hospital, Chandrapur

Pathanpura Gate, At Arwat, Post Marda Ta. Dist. Chandrapur E-mail Address:-pbhmc@rediffmail.com, pbhmcchandrapur@gmail.com - 7757962370

Recognised by National Commission for Homoeopathy Central Govt. of India New Delhi & Maharashtra Govt. of Mumbai Affiliated to Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik

Ref No.: PBHMC&H/18446/ 2024

Date: 26/09/2024

To

The Principal Secretary,
Ministry of Ayush,

Government of India,

NEW DELHI

Ministry of AYUSH RECEIVED ON 27 SEP 2024 Ayush Bhawan, B-Block G.P.O. Complex, INA. New Delhi-23

APPELLANT:

Principal , Purushottamdas Bagla Homoeopathic Medical College

and Hospital, Pathanpura Gate, Marda Road, at Arwat, District:

Chandrapur-422402.

Subject

Appeal under section 9(6) of the National Commission for

Homoeopathy Act, 2020

Sir,

The appellant is approaching this Hon'ble Authority being aggrieved by the decision dated 17th September, 2024, passed by the Secretary of National Commission for Homoeopathy reiterating decision of the Medical Assessment and Rating Board in Homoeopathy dated 13/8/2024 by which the Board for Homoeopathy had in pursuance of the application for permission to sanction 50 seats in BHMS Course for the academic session 2024-2025 had taken inspection on 6/8/2024

BY SPEED POST/E-MAIL

F. No. R-14014/127/2020-EP-II

भारत सरकार

Government of India आयुष मंत्रालय

Ministry of Ayush

"आयुष भवन", "Ayush Bhawan" "बी" ब्लाक, जी.पी.ओ. काम्प्लेक्स, आई.एन.ए., नई दिल्ली-110 023 'B' Block, GPO Complex, INA, New Delhi-110 023 Date: 25.11.2024

To,

The Principal,

Purushottam Das Bagla Homoeopathic Medical College and Hospital,

Pathanpura Gate, At Arwat, Post Marda, Dist. Chandrapur, Maharashtra- 422402

Email: pbhmcchandrapur@gmail.com

Sub: An appeal made by Principal, Purushottam Das Bagla Homoeopathic Medical College and Hospital, Pathanpura, Marda road, Arawat, Dist. Chandrapur, Maharashtra- 422402 under Section 29(6) of the National Commission for Homoeopathy Act, 2020 against the denial of the first appeal dated 17.09.2024 by NCH and Denial Letter dated 13.08.2024 by MARBH, NCH to continue permission in BHMS Course with intake capacity of 50 seats for the Academic Year 2024-25 - reg.

Sir/Madam,

This has reference to your second appeal dated 26.09.2024 preferred to the Central Government against the disposal of first Appeal by NCH vide order dated 17.09.2024 regarding continuation of permission at Homoeopathic Medical College namely Purushottam Das Bagla Homoeopathic Medical College and Hospital, Pathanpura, Marda road, Arawat, Dist. Chandrapur, Maharashtra with intake capacity of 50 seats for the Academic Year 2024-25.

2. That the said scheme/application for permission of Purushottam Das Bagla Homoeopathic Medical College and Hospital, Pathanpura, Marda road, Arawat, Dist. Chandrapur, Maharashtra to continue permission in BHMS Course with intake capacity of 50 seats for the Academic Year 2024-25 was disapproved by the Medical Assessment and Rating Board for Homeopathy vide order 13.08.2024. Thereafter, the First Appeal filed by you before the National Commission for Homeopathy was also dismissed vide order dated 17.0.2024 due to following deficiencies:-

Observation on Teaching Faculty:

1. Non-Correlation of Teachers' Names with Registers: The College has provided appointment letters of 36 teachers as per the attendance register and acquittance payment sheet for 26 staff members. The affidavit for 10 honorary staff members has also been submitted. However, in the month of Aug. on random checking it has been observed that there are no signatures against the name of a few teachers. And the registers are manually maintained. No biometric attendance sheet submitted.

- 2. Absence of Teaching Faculty on Inspection Day: Out of 24 teaching staffs, only 16 were present during the inspection. The college has submitted leave applications and proof of participation in a workshop at Pune for 5 teachers, with an additional 3 teachers on leave. The documentation provided includes leave applications and workshop certificates. However, there is still absence of 8 faculty members, particularly on the same day, raises concerns about faculty availability and commitment.
- 3. Consultants for Modern Medicine: The college claims to have visiting faculty for modern medicine for theory and clinical classes. However, this assertion needs verification, as no consultants were present during the inspection. Records of attendance and appointment letters of modern medicine consultants are provided. The submission lacks bank statements/EPF/ESIC/ and form 16 to verify the Genuity. Moreover, the submission lacks the biometric attendance sheet which raises more concern.
- 4. Verification of Teaching Faculty Attendance and Salary: The college has submitted the appointment letters, salary records, but lacks bank statements/ EPF/ESIC/ and form 16 for verification. The attendance record of all faculty members is also submitted. There are some discrepancies exist having mismatching signatures and in month of Aug missing signatures for few teachers raising doubts.

Observation on Hospital Facilities

- 1. Low Patient Inflow: As reported, the inspection team observed only 5-6 patients in the OPD, with an overall low patient inflow. The college has stated that patient flow is average for the rest of the day and submitted the document of the register. It raises concern on authentic submission.
- 2. Absence of Departmental OPD Registers: The College has implemented separate departmental OPD registers as of August 8, 2024, i.e. after inspection. The submission of these registers for verification. The use of a central OPD register previously led to confusion.
- 3. Functionality of OPDs and Wards: During the inspection, only three OPDs (Medicine, Surgery, OBG) were functional. The college has now created a separate Pediatric OPD and ward. Photos and documentation have been submitted.
- 4. Poor Record Management: OPD and IPD records were poorly maintained, with blank and half-filled pages observed. The college's explanation for the blank and half-filled pages in the central OPD register due to delays in data entry is inadequate. Timely and accurate record-keeping is essential, and using rough records raises concerns

about reliability and transparency. The college plans to digitize records and has submitted the bill for the purchase of software.

- 5. Discrepancies in OPD and IPD Registration: Issues with mismatched registration numbers between OPD and IPD records were identified as human error. The college has promised to rectify this. But these kinds of errors undermine the credibility of the hospital's records.
- 6. Non-Functional Infrastructure: Issues such as non-functional toilets in IPD wards, non- operational X ray units, and poorly maintained OT and labor rooms were identified during inspection. The college has since repaired these facilities, submitting photographs and 17/09/24 bills as evidence. However, it is crucial that these facilities are maintained in the long term.
- 7. Pathology Department and ECG Availability: The Clinical Pathology Department was poorly managed, and ECG machines were unavailable. The college claims to have restored the water supply and provided necessary equipment, with bills and records submitted.
- 8. Manipulated IPD Records: There were concerns regarding IPD records, with entries in the same handwriting and discrepancies in patient admission dates. The college has committed to improve record keeping practices and ensuring alignment between OPD and IPD records. These claims need verification through future audits.
- 9. Dispensing of Medicines: The dispensing unit was nearly nonfunctional during the inspection, with limited stock. The college claims to have restocked and organized the dispensing area, with supporting bills attached. The dispensing register is also now being maintained. Observation on College Facilities
- 10. Library and Learning Resources: As reported by MARBH, the library was poorly managed, with no book purchases since 2019 and the absence of a librarian. The college has submitted a leave application for librarian with the bills for new book purchases and photographs of the improved library.
- 11. Insufficient Computer Lab Equipment: The Repertory Department's computer lab was found to have insufficient, available with bills submitted.
- 12. Lack of Industrial Visits in PSM Department: The college failed to conduct mandatory industrial visits for students over the past two years. Certificates of recent visits and photographs have been provided.
- 13. Power Backup and Drinking Water: The college lacked adequate power backup, relying only on inverters. They have committed to installing a new generator. Drinking water is outsourced daily due to high TDS levels in the groundwater. Submission of bills of outsourced water cans.
- 14. Seminar Hall Maintenance: The seminar hall was poorly maintained, with cracks and dampness. The college has committed to repairing the hall within three months, submitting an affidavit to this effect.

 Observation on Student Feedback
- 1. Inadequate Conduct of Theory and Practical Classes: Students reported that theory and practical classes, particularly in Anatomy, Physiology, and Pharmacy, have not been conducted regularly. The college has submitted foc attendance and class schedules.
 - 2. Lack of Practical Experience: The absence of dissection and

practical classes for over eight months is concerning. This is a significant gap in medical education to meet educational standards. The college has submitted records of classes conducted with attendance and class schedules

Overall observation:

- 1. Teaching Faculty Attendance and Non-Correlation with Registers: There are discrepancies in the teaching faculty's attendance records, with mismatched signatures and missing entries, especially in August.
- 2. Absence of AEBAS: The Adhaar Enabled Biometric Attendance System (AEBAS) is not enabled yet, which is a critical requirement and renders the submission unacceptable.
- 3. Consultants for Modern Medicine: The college claims to have modern medicine consultants for classes; however, none were present during inspection. There is a lack of supporting documents such as bank statements and biometric attendance.
- 4. Low Patient Inflow and OPD Functionality: The inspection revealed a very low patient inflow in the OPD, with only 5-6 patients present. The college's claim of average patient flow throughout the day lacks convincing documentation, raising concerns about the hospital's functionality.
- 5. Poor Record Management and Discrepancies: OPD and IPD records were poorly maintained. This poor management undermines the credibility of the hospital's records and its operational transparency.
- 6. Non-Functional and Poorly Maintained Infrastructure: Key facilities, such as the X-ray unit, OT, and toilets, were non-functional during inspection. The college has since repaired them, but long-term maintenance of infrastructure remains a concern.
- 7. Inadequate Library Resources and Computer Lab Equipment: The library was poorly managed, with no new book purchases since 2019, and a lack of a librarian on duty. The Repertory Department's computer lab was also inadequately equipped, with only five desktops which were made available post-inspection.
- 8. Discrepancies in IPD Records: There were issues with patient records in IPD, with entries appearing to be appearing to be written in the same handwriting and conflicting patient admission dates. The colleges agreed and have promised to rectify.
- 9. Non-Functional Dispensing Unit: The college's medicine dispensing unit was almost non- functional during inspection, with limited stock. The college has since restocked the unit, but its functionality needs close monitoring.
- 10. Student Feedback on Inadequate Practical and Theory Classes: Students reported that theory and practical classes, especially in Anatomy, Physiology, and Pharmacy, have not been conducted regularly. The absence of dissection classes for over eight months is a serious concern affecting the quality of education.
- 11. General Facilities and Industrial Visits: The college's failure to conduct mandatory industrial visits, along with issues like insufficient power backup, poor seminar hall maintenance, and outsourced drinking water, demonstrates a lack of focus on student welfare and overall facility management.

3. Aggrieved by the said order of the Commission, the second appeal dated 26.09.2024 has been filed before the Central Government under Section 29(6) of the National Commission for Homoeopathy Act, 2020. During the consideration of this Appeal the submissions and documents submitted by the college and documents received from the National Commission for Homoeopathy (NCH) have been examined carefully and placed before the Committee (constituted vide order Dy. No. 381034 dated 10.09.2024) on 12.11.2024 and the following observations have been observed by the Committee: -

S.	Observation of the	Resubmission	Observation of
No	Commission	of College	Section
1.	Non-Correlation of	For the query	The College has
	Teachers' Names	about name of	submitted appointment
	with Registers: The	teachers not	letters of 36 teachers
	college has provided	correlating with	and acquittance
	appointment letters of	attendance	payment sheet for 26
	36 teachers as per the	register. We are	staff members. The
	attendance register	enclosing the	affidavit for 10
	and acquittance	appointment	honorary staff members has also been
	payment sheet for 26	letter of 36	nas also been
	staff members. The	teacners in	submitted. The College has submitted manual
	affidavit for 10	attendance	nas submitted manual
	honorary staff	register. For the	attendance registers and Biometric
	members has also been	normont choot of	
	submitted. However, in	26 staff mambars	attendance which is not Aadhaar based. Upon
	the month of Aug. on	is attached 10	randomly reviewing the
	han showed that	staff members	attendance register for
	been observed that	are on honorary	August 2024, it is
	against the name of a	designation the	observed that there are
	fow teachers And the	affidavit is	no signatures next to
	registers are manually	attached for	the names of certain
	maintained. No	same.	teaching faculty
	biometric attendance		members which create
	sheet submitted.		doubt about genuine
			presence of teaching
			staff. Further, on
			examination of
			appointment orders it
			is found that no
			reference numbers in
			some appointment
			orders & experience
			certificates and no
			receiving on joining
			letters mentioned, so
			submitted documents
			cannot be relied upon.
	I		

> No acquittance roll. bank statements for the teaching staff has been provided; only generated salary sheets submitted. Further, no Aadhaar based Biometric attendance records have been submitted by the College in their submission during second appeal to the Central Government. As per the subregulation 9A. Homoeopathy Central Council (Minimum Standards Requirement of Homoeopathic Colleges and attached Hospitals) Regulations, 2013 amended up to 2019, the college failed t.o substantiate the attendance through Aadhaar Based Geo location enabled Biometric Attendance system teaching for staff.

Absence of Teaching Out 2. Faculty Inspection of 24 teaching staffs, members only 16 were present present, The college submitted applications and proof work-shop workshop at Pune for 5 teachers were on present in teachers, with additional leave. on documentation provided includes leave copy applications

on teaching Day: Out members has duty to leave|NCH 3 teachers applications The the teachers are application provided of and training

24The College has staffsubmitted manual 16 attendance and were biometric attendance of 5 teaching staff which is during the inspection teachers were on not Aadhaar based. On attend sample basis, it is found CBDC that some staff submit atlted application of participation in a Pune (MS) and 3 leave but still marked biometric an leave. The leave attendance like Dr. SC of Joshi given leave from and 05.08.2024 to CBDC 07.08.2024, but his leavelattendance is marked

> However, there is still absence of 8 faculty members, particularly on the same day, raises concerns about faculty availability and

commitment.

workshop certificates. also provided.

present in biometric. Similarly Dr Bhagyashree submitted leave application 07.08.2024. but marked present in biometric attendance. given Zenith application for attending a workshop Pune from at. 07.08.2024 to 10.08.2024. but her attendance is marked on 07.08.2024. Dr. P B Meshram and Dr Sirai Khan had application for attending a workshop Pune from 07.08.2024-09.08.2024, but marked present in Biometric. Hence, the submitted documents cannot be relied upon.

Consultants for We Modern Medicine: The college of claims to have visiting medicine faculty for theory medicine for classes clinical clinical However, this assertion The needs verification, as attendance no consultants were theory present during inspection. Records of as well as the most attendance appointment letters of letters of faculty and modern consultants provided. submission lacks bank|provided) statements/ EPF/ESIC/ and form 16 to verify the Genuity. Moreover, submission lacks the

biometric

the

have classes.land record and appointment medicine members

the The college claims to faculty members have visiting faculty for modern medicine for whotheory and modern are visiting for classes. The college has andsubmitted attendance appointment ofletters of modern oflmedicine consultants. and However, no reference the practical classes numbers mentioned on of the appointment orders experience certificates. are included for the College has submitted The record (Affidavit one affidavit, which is dated post inspection. Moreover, the submission lacks the Aadhar based biometric attendance. On random examination the of

> attendance sheet which raises more concern.

attendance submitted records, it has been observed that Dr. Manish Mundhada's name is not present in the manual register but his biometric attendance submitted. Further, Dr. Rekha V. Dandekar is marked present 14.08.2024 in manual register but absent in biometric record. This creates serious concerns about the authenticity of these records and the actual presence of Modern medicine consultants in the College. As the per regulation 9(2) of Homoeopathy Central Council (Minimum Standards Requirement Homoeopathic of Colleges and attached Hospitals) Regulations, 2013 amended up to 2019, the college failed substantiate to the presence Modern medicine consultants in the College.

4. Verification Teaching Attendance Salary: The has submitted appointment salarv records, lacks bank statements/salary EPF/ESIC/ and form 16 and bank record verification. for attendance record of attendance all faculty members is record of all 24

of The appointment Same as in Observation Faculty letter of all 24 at Point 1. and faculty members college submitted for the verification. letters, the acquaintance butlthe record register The is attached. The also submitted. There faculty members

are some discrepancies submitted for having verification. exist mismatching signatures and month of Aug missing signatures for few teachers raising doubts. Patient On the day of The College Low 5-6|submitted Central and **Inflow:** As reported, visit only were Departmental team patients inspection the records of the month of 5-6 seen by observed only but August patients in the OPD committee 2024. with an overall low|the flow of the|random examination. The patients for the inspector's remarks patient inflow. college has stated that rest of the day indicating "no entry till patient flow is average was average. 3:50 pm" have been patient flow is average was average. found written on the for the rest of the day pages of OPD register submitted the on 06.08.2024 i.e. the document of the day of Inspection and register. It raises the College concern on authentic overwritten patients' submission. entries on these pages which is objectionable and raises serious concerns about the integrity of the records. The College does not comply with regulation 7(2)& 7(3) of Homoeopathy Central Council, **MSR** regulations 2013 amended upto 2019. of Instead of OPD The College Absence has **OPD** department submitted manual Departmental Registers: The college register a central records implemented register was in Departmental **OPDs** has separate departmental practice for the from 08.08.2024 and ofrecord of they have accepted the OPD registers as 2024, i.e. patients. As fact that they were not August 8, The advised by thelmaintaining these after inspection. these|respected records before submission of for committee from inspection. registers verification. The use of 8 August 2024 The College does not a central OPD register onward comply with regulation to|separated 7(3) of Homoeopathy previously led

	confusion.	patients. As	Central Council, MSR
			regulations 2013 as
		_	amended upto 2019.
		committee from	
		8 August 2024	
		onward	
		separated	
		Department OPD	
		register are	
		prepared and	
		kept along for	
		verification.	
7.			As mentioned in Point 3
	OPDs and	and Pediatric	above, the College has
	Wards: During the	OPD were	accepted the fact that
	inspection, only three	functional at	they were not
	OPDs (Medicine	lsame place and	maintaining Paediatricl
	Surgery, OBG) were	total 3 OPD's	OPD and Ward
	functional. The college		separately before
	has now created a	operational. As	inspection.
	separate Pediatric OPD	per advice	The College does not
	and ward. Photos and	separate	comply with regulation
			7(3) of Homoeopathy
	been submitted.		Central Council, MSR
		the photograph	
			amended upto 2019.
		submitted for verification. The	
		total number of	
		OPD now is 4	
		namely	
		Medicine,	
		Surgery,	
		Obst/Gyn and	
		Pediatrics	
		respectively.	
		The patients	
		receiving care at	
		college hospital	
		indoor facility	
		are regularly	
		given diet	
		according to diet	
		chart. The food	
		for patients is	
		provided on	
0	D D 1	charity basis.	The submission of the
	Poor Record		The submission of the
	Management : OPD	pialik/liali-filled	College regarding entry

and IPD records were pages found in of OPD data first in a poorly maintained, with central OPD rough register and then blank and half-filled register was due in the Central OPD pages observed. Thelto delav in register on daily basis explanation entering college's the cannot be accepted. for the blank and half-names. In Further. the remark the routine practice made by Inspector lfilled pages in register a rough record indicating "no entry till central OPD of 3:50 pm" found written due to delays in data of name inadequate. Pt/Redg. No. is on the pages of OPD entry is Timely and accurate made for each register on 06.08.2024 then i.e. record-keeping isday and the day of essential. usingentered to Inspection cannot be and rough records raises central OPD denied. about register. concerns The The College has and record of both submitted a tax invoice reliability The rough and fair dated 23.08.2024 transparency. college plans to digitize copies has been the purchase of has submitted and for software. However. submitted the bill for verification. they have also provided purchase college self-generated lthe ofThe software. hospital register computerized have the name of OPD records. which college andinclude prescriptions address. that raise concerns. Photocopy of Additionally. these same is provided. records are dated prior For the improper to the purchase date of foundlthe record software. as with Welindicated IPD. in the assure you that submitted invoice. medical questioning our the officers will authenticity of these verify the IPD records. records and also The College does not bring alignment comply with regulation in the posting of |7(3)| of Homoeopathy Central Council, MSR Internees Doctors. regulations 2013 amended upto 2019. **Discrepancies in OPD** As by The College advised **IPD** respected submitted a tax invoice Issue committee dated 23.08.2024 **Registration:** $mismatched \\ | members$ thelthe purchase of with number college OPD and software. However, registration between OPD and IPD IPD records will they have also provided on self-generated records were identified be shifted

as human error. The digital

platform computerized

in near future. OPD records,

> bill oflinclude college has promised to The prescriptions rectify this. But these software that raise concerns. kinds of errorsburchased is Additionally. these lundermine the attached. records are dated prior to the purchase date of credibility of the hospital's records. software. indicated in the submitted invoice. guestioning the authenticity of these records. The College does not comply with regulation 7(3) of Homoeopathy Central Council, MSR 2013 regulations amended upto 2019.

Non-Functional toilets in IPD wards, and non- operational X ray maintenance. units. and maintained OT llabor rooms lidentified has since these facilities, of submitting photographs and bills maintained are evidence. However, photograph arelfor facilities term.

The IPD toilets The College has Infrastructure: Issues and water supply submitted some such as non-functional was under repair photographs and bills of the repaired toilets, X-ray machine, OT and poorly The photo copies Labor room and AMC and of bills and the report of X-ray were photographs oflmachine. On during repaired toilets examination of these inspection. The college|submitted for the|documents, it has been repaired record. The OT observed that the AMC college report and are willafter hospital is date of and inspection. of Further. these lit is crucial that these OT is attached documents cannot your justify the functionality maintained in the long verification. The of X-ray department, non-functional X-OT and Labor room and ray oftoilets in IPD wards as Unit college hospital other documents like under departmental registers maintenance and of these departments be and IPD case records operational for referral have not within 10 been submitted for the working days. same. The college does The photocopies not comply with subof maintenance regulation 11(1) and expenses is schedule-III of **MSR** for 2013, as it failed to attached

> verification. The substantiate functional SPO2 Machine X-ray, OT and Labor has been madelunits. available to the IPD. The bill for purchase attached for your verification.

11. **Pathology Department and ECG** of **Availability:** Clinical Department poorly managed, and copy ECG machines were contract unavailable. college claims to have is attached. The one restored that supply and submitted.

The water supply The College submitted clinical that water supply of The pathology clinical pathology Pathology department is department is restored, were restored and the but no BMW document is submitted of with by the College. The The service provides College has submitted copy of water technician found contract with service provided late for duty was provider and equipment, due to persistent submitted invoice with bills and records rainfall. A copy May, June & July 2024. of appointment Further, the College letter andhas submitted attendance is appointment attached for your joining report verification. manual attendance of The ECG May-August 2024 machine has Lab technician madelPrashant been available to theNagrale. However no IPD. The bill for educational is qualification documents attached for your have been submitted by verification. the College. Additionally, his name found is not. Biometric attendance records submitted which raises

about

ECG

post

presence

hospital.

his

College submitted invoice

machine

Further College has not

22.08.2024, which

in

order.

and

of

Mr.

Kartik

doubt

actual

the

of

dated

inspection.

submitted any **ECG** register, referral record to justify the functionality of **ECG** The department. college does not comply sub-regulation with 11(1) and schedule-III of MSR 2013, as it failed to substantiate functional ECG units and clinical laboratory. OPD The **IPD** The 12. College Manipulated **Records:** There were registration accepted that the not records of OPD and IPD concerns regarding IPD number records, with entries in matching with are filled manually and the same handwriting IPD record was a submitted that discrepancies in human error. Institute will install and of digital platform in near admission The record patient OPD future. The College has dates. The college has IPD and committed to improve register can be also submitted a Tax keeping verified to check invoice dated practices and ensuring alignment. The 23.08.2024 regarding between records of OPD the purchase alignment are software. Further, OPD and IPD records. and IPD's the need|filled manually College has These claims through making itsubmitted the manual verification difficult to Central IPD register for future audits. search them. Welfew days of month of assure that the August. No records of both records of IPD patients OPD and IPD are have been submitted by linear the College. The The College does not alignment. Institute in near comply with regulation future will install 7(3) of Homoeopathy digital platform Central Council, MSR overcome regulations 2013 such difficulties. amended upto 2019. The IPD record of the patient including date of admission is submitted for vour verification. Due to poor understanding of language the patient answered

of As per the advice The College 13. Dispensing respected accepted Medicines: Theby that the was committee dispensing area is now dispensing unit the modified with sufficient non-functional members during the inspection, dispensing area number of Hom. with limited stock. The is now modified Medicines. The College sufficient has submitted invoice college claims to have with and number of Hom. for purchase restocked the Medicines. As medicines dated post organized dispensing area, with per the advice by inspection, however, no bills Respected copy of stock register is supporting The Committee provided to verify the attached. dispensing register is members the same. The College does not comply being Dispensing with also now register is now regulation maintained. 7(4)maintained Homoeopathy Central according to the Council. **MSR** quidelines. Aregulations 2013 as Photocopy of amended upto 2019. same is provided verification. The bills of the purchase Hom. Medicines. Biochemic medicines and Mother Tincture is attached for verification. The use of Mother Tincture was not practice at college hospital. Library and Learning The library area The 14. College has well|submitted the Resources: Asis reported by MARBH, maintained. The photographs the library was poorly Bills of purchase library, credit bill for 9 managed, with no book of new books is books (dated purchases since 2019 attached for inspection) and a selfand the absence of a verification. The prepared list of books librarian. The college|Photograph ofshowing total of a has submitted a leave College library is 16,013 books. application for librarian also attached. However, these provided documents with the bills for new insufficient lare book purchases and confirm the photographs actual the availability of the listed improved library. books in the College's

			Library. The leave application of the Librarian does not bear any diary number which creates doubt about its reliability. The College does not comply with Schedule III of Homoeopathy Central Council, MSR regulations 2013 as amended upto 2019.
15.	Insufficient	1 desktop is	amended upto 2019. The College has
		available at dept	
	Equipment: The Repertory Department's computer lab was found to have insufficient equipment. The college claims that five desktops are now available with bills submitted	of Repertory on 1st floor where as 5 desktop are available at computer lab of department of Repertory at ground floor.	invoices regarding purchase of computers dated June 2024, however the observation made by the Inspectors during Inspection in the month of August regarding insufficient Computer Lab Equipment cannot be denied. Therefore, the submission cannot be accepted. The College does not comply with Schedule I(B) of Homoeopathy Central Council, MSR regulations 2013 as amended upto 2019.
16.	Department : The	of students recent visit to	The College has submitted few photographs (which are
	conduct mandatory industrial visits for students over the past two years. Certificates	Dept. of PSM is attached for verification. The photographs of such visits are	not legible) and some documents showing last visit in 2022. The documents submitted for last year visit has been self-created by the College and no official document from the authority which is claimed to have been visited has been submitted. Therefore, their claim is not

acceptable. **Power Backup and** As per advised The College respected submitted **Drinking Water:** The by bills for lacked committee a new purchase of Cold water college power generator will be cans from April to July adequate backup, relying only on installed in near 2024 and accepted that They have future to meet a new generator will be inverters. committed to installing the purpose. installed in near future generator. Due to high TDS to meet the power is value of ground backup. No relevant water Drinking outsourced daily due towater we are document to procure a high TDS levels in the using canned generator has been potable water. submitted by the groundwater. Submission of bills of Bill water College. of outsourced water cans. supplied for drinking is attached. 18. Seminar **Hall** As advised by the The College submitted an affidavit The respected Maintenance: seminar hall was poorly committee from the management with members the that the maintenance maintained. cracks and dampness.|Seminar hall will|work of the College & hasbe thoroughly Hospital will be college committed to repairing repaired within 3 completed 03 within the hall within three months. Anlmonths of time. the months, submitting an affidavit from the Therefore, management on deficiency not affidavit to this effect. the same subject rectified till now. lis also attached for verification. 19. Inadequate Conduct The record of The College and Theory and submitted theory and of Theory practical class records practical Practical Students conducted for and attendance Classes: reported that theory the of students. However, the dept. feedback of students to and practical classes, anatomy, & the Inspectors during in Physiology particularly Physiology, Pharmacy is inspection cannot be Anatomy. Pharmacy, have attached along denied. and conducted with attendance not been regularly. The College of students. has submitted records of classes conducted attendance with and class schedules. Lack of **Practical** Experience: The absence of dissection

and practical classes for over eight months is concerning. This is a significant gap in medical education to meet educational standards. The college has submitted records of classes conducted with attendance and class schodulos

- 20. Overall observations:
 - 1 . Teaching Faculty Attendance and Non-Correlation with **Registers:** There are discrepancies in the lteaching faculty's attendance records. with mismatched signatures and missing entries, especially in August.
 - 2 . **Absence of AEBAS:** The Adhaar
 Enabled Biometric
 Attendance System
 (AEBAS) is not enabled
 yet, which is a critical
 requirement and
 renders the submission
 unacceptable.
 - 3 . Consultants for Modern

Medicine: The college claims to have modern medicine consultants for classes; however, none were present inspection. during There is a lack of supporting documents such bank as statements and biometric attendance.

4. Low Patient Inflow and OPD Functionality:

- College The submitted the manual attendance register and biometric attendance records, which are not Aadhaar-based. Certain entries for teaching faculty members lack signatures next to their names, therefore, their actual presence in the College cannot be iustified.
- The College has submitted biometric attendance records, which are not Aadhaarbased.
- 3. The submission of the College lacks the Aadhaar based biometric attendance. Additionally, there are discrepancies between the manual register and biometric records: the names οf certain consultants are absent from the manual register but are marked present in the biometric record, while other consultants are listed as present in the manual register but absent in the biometric attendance.
- 4. The Inspector's

inspection revealed a very low patient inflow in the OPD, with only 5-6 patients present. The college's claim of average patient flow throughout the dav lacks convincing documentation, raising concerns about the hospital's functionality. . Poor Record Management and OPD Discrepancies: and IPD records were poorly maintained. This poor management undermines the

6 . Non-Functional and Poorly Maintained

hospital's records and

of

operational

credibility

transparency.

its

the

Infrastructure: Key facilities, such as the X-OT. rav unit. and toilets. were nonfunctional during inspection. The college since repaired them. but long-term maintenance linfrastructure remains a concern.

7. Inadequate Library Resources and Computer Lab Equipment: The library was poorly managed, with no new book purchases since 2019, and a lack of a librarian on duty. The Repertory Department's computer lab was also

"no remarks, noting entry till 3:50 pm," were found written in the OPD register on 06.08.2024, the day of the inspection. It has also been observed that the College has overwritten patient entries on these pages, which is highly objectionable and raises significant concerns about the integrity and authenticity of the records. 5. The College's submission of first recording OPD data in a rough register before transferring it to the Central OPD register on a daily basis is not acceptable. Additionally, the submission selfof generated computerized Central OPD records, including prescriptions, raises serious concerns regarding the accuracy and reliability of the data. 6. The submitted not documents do adequately support the functioning of the X-ray department, OT, labor room, and toilets in the IPD wards. Key records, such as departmental registers and IPD case records for referrals have not been provided by the

College, leaving gaps in

the documentation for

inadequately equipped, with only five desktops which were made available postinspection.

- 8 . **Discrepancies** IPD Records: There with were issues patient records in IPD. with entries appearing to be written in the same handwriting and conflicting patient admission dates. The colleges agreed and have promised t.o rectify.
- 9 . Non-Functional **Dispensing Unit:** The college's medicine dispensing unit was almost non-functional during inspection, with limited stock. The college has since restocked the unit, but its functionality needs close monitoring.
- 10. Student Feedback on Inadequate Practical and Theory Classes: Students reported that theory and practical classes, especially in Anatomy, Physiology, and Pharmacy, have not been conducted regularly. The absence of dissection classes for over eight months is a serious concern affecting the quality of education.
- 11. **General Facilities and Industrial Visits**:
 The college's failure to conduct mandatory

acceptance.

- 7. The documents provided insufficient to verify the actual availability the listed books in the College Library. Additionally, the concerns raised by the Inspectors during the regarding inspection inadequate Computer Lab equipment cannot be dismissed.
- 8. The College has only submitted the manual Central IPD register for few days of month of August. However, no case records of IPD patients have been submitted by the College.
- 9. The College has submitted an invoice for the purchase of medicines dated after the inspection, but has not provided a copy of the stock register to verify the same.
- 10. The feedback provided by students to the Inspectors during the inspection, highlighting irregularities in the conduction of theory and practical classes particularly in Anatomy, Physiology, Pharmacy—along and with the absence dissection classes for over eight months, cannot be overlooked. The documents 11.
- 11. The documents submitted for last year visit has been self-

industrial visits, along with issues like insufficient power backup, poor seminar hall maintenance, and outsourced drinking water, demonstrates a llack of focus on student welfare and overall facility management.

created by the College official and no document from the authority which claimed to have been has submitted. No relevant document to procure a generator has been submitted by the College. The College has submitted affidavit from the management that the maintenance work of the College & Hospital completed will be within 03 months of time. Therefore, the deficiency of poor seminar hall maintenance still remains unresolved. The College has submitted bills for purchase of Cold water cans from April to July 2024 in relation to submission regarding outsourced drinking water. As per MSR, 2013, to substantiate the claim of genuine functionality of Homoeopathic hospital, the college hospital and shall maintain the computerized central registration system for maintaining the records of patients in OPD department and department, and shall also maintain the department wise OPD and IPD records, case papers of OPD and IPD, laboratory and

radiological
investigation reports,
medicine dispensing
register, diet register
for IPD patients, duty
roster of hospital staff
etc. for last one
calendar year.

Recommendation of Committee:-In view of the facts/circumstance mentioned above the Committee agrees with the stand taken by National commission for Homoeopathy, New Delhi.

- 4. In view of the position explained in paras above, based on the submission made by the said college during Second appeal and examining of all the relevant documents received from NCH and recommendations of committee, it is found that the College is NOT fulfilling the requirements for granting permission to Purushottam Das Bagla Homoeopathic Medical College and Hospital, Pathanpura, Marda road, Arawat, Dist. Chandrapur, Maharashtra- 422402 to continue permission in BHMS Course with intake capacity of 50 seats for the Academic Year 2024-25, as per relevant Acts and regulations. The deficiencies pertaining to functionality of Hospital & College is of such a serious and fundamental in nature and adversely affecting the ability of the Hospital & College to provide quality treatment and Medical Education.
- 5. THEREFORE, it has been decided by the Central Government that the second appeal dated 26.09.2024 made by Principal, Purushottam Das Bagla Homoeopathic Medical College and Hospital, Pathanpura, Marda road, Arawat, Dist. Chandrapur, Maharashtra- 422402 to continue permission in BHMS Course with intake capacity of 50 seats for the Academic Year 2024-25, is dismissed as it has no merits.

Yours faithfully, Digitally signed by Madan Lal Meena Date: 25-11-2024 11:36:20

(Madan Lal Meena)

Under Secretary to the Government of India

Copy to:

i. The Chairperson, NCH, 61-65 Institutional Area, Opp. 'D' Block, Janakpuri, New Delhi - 110 058 for information and necessary action for the next academic session.

ii. The Director, CET Cell Maharashtra 8th floor, New Exceision Building, A.K. Nayak Marg, Fort, Mumbai- 400001.Email id: maharashtra.cetcell@gmail.com

iii. The Registrar, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Dindori Road, Nashik- 422004. Email: registrar@muhs.ac.in